

NAME _____

DATE _____

Performance Tasks – Social Comparison: Influence of 19th c. Ideologies

Goal of task

Target concept: In this Building Block, you will compare how Enlightenment philosophers and Marxist thinkers sustained or challenged gender roles. For this task, you will be evaluated on your ability to:

- Differentiate ideas regarding gender roles from Enlightenment philosophers and Marxist thinkers.
- Identify comparisons regarding gender roles between Enlightenment philosophers and Marxist thinkers.
- Create direct comparisons that highlight those similarities and differences.
- Analyze similarities and differences in how 19th-century ideologies sustained and/or challenged gender roles and social hierarchies, specifically looking at gender roles in Enlightenment and Marxist writings.
- Explain the reasons for these similarities and differences with evidence
- Connect your arguments to other times or places with similar patterns

Task summary

There are three main tasks associated with this Performance Task. First, you will read, discuss and sort quotations from 19th-century Enlightenment and Marxist thinkers into correct categories. Second, you will identify specific similarities and differences in the ways 19th-century Enlightenment and Marxist thinkers sustained or challenged the accepted gender roles of their era. Third, you will craft statements of direct comparison, explain reasons, develop a thesis, and link your claims to other places or times (synthesis). This will illustrate your mastery of comparison as a historical thinking skill and your knowledge on this theme and era.

Task 1: Enlightenment or Marxist Thinker? (In small groups)

1. Your teacher will divide the class into groups of 4-5 students. As a group define and discuss examples of the following terms
 - Marxism
 - Socialism
 - Communism
 - Enlightenment
2. Your teacher will hand each small group an envelope which contains quotes related to gender roles from both Enlightenment and Marxist thinkers. Working with your group members, read each quote, discuss what it means, and then determine if it is an Enlightenment quote or a Marxist quote. Then, answer the questions provided to you.

Note: You will have to read each quotation carefully to understand its message and to discern its category. Remember, not all Enlightenment thinkers had the same ideas, nor did all Marxist thinkers, so to make accurate determinations for the categories, you must consider the big ideas or principles associated with each ideology. (Quotes have been labeled to enable easy checking for accuracy by your teacher, but the letters have nothing to do with the correct category; this is not a de-coding activity!)

Brainstorming and Organizing Data

19th-Century Philosophy and Gender Roles

Enlightenment Thinkers	Marxist Thinkers

A

“The education of women should always be relative to that of men. To please, to be useful to us, to make us love and esteem them, to educate us when young, to take care of us when grown up, to advise, to console us, to render our lives easy and agreeable; these are the duties of women at all times, and what they should be taught in their infancy.”

CC

“The laws must be the expression of the general will; all female and male citizens must contribute either personally or through their representatives to its formation; it must be the same for all: male and female citizens, being equal in the eyes of the law, must be equally admitted to all honors, positions, and public employment according to their capacity and without other distinctions besides those of their virtues and talents.”

ZZ

“Women, wake up; the tocsin of reason sounds throughout the universe; recognize your rights.”

P

“As well as being active and diligent, girls should be early subjected to restraint. This misfortune, if that’s what it is, is inseparable from their sex; and if they ever throw it off they will suffer evils much crueller than that. They must throughout their lives be subject to the most constant and severe restraint, which is that of decorum; so they must get used to it early, so that it won’t hit them too hard later on. They should also get used to the suppression of their caprices, so that they will be readier to submit to the will of others -later on-; even if it is work that they are most fond of, they should be sometimes compelled to lay it aside. If their upbringing is too permissive, their basic propensities will give rise to dissipation, levity, and inconstancy. To prevent this abuse, we should teach them above all things to restrain themselves properly. Our absurd institutions reduce the life of a modest woman to a perpetual conflict with herself, though it is fair that this sex should share in the sufferings arising from the evils it has caused us.”

L

“Once it has been demonstrated that man and woman aren’t and oughtn’t to be constituted alike in temperament and character, it follows of course that they should not be educated in the same manner. In pursuing the directions of nature they ought indeed to act in concert but they shouldn’t be engaged in the same employments: the final goal of their activities should be the same, but the means they take to accomplish them, and thus their tastes and inclinations, should be different.... Men depend on women only because of their desires; women depend on men because of their desires and also because of their needs. We could survive without them better than they could without us.----”

E

“Man’s greatest concern is to know how he shall properly fill his place in the universe and correctly understand what he must be in order to be a man.”

WW

“The truth, not fully recognized even by those anxious to do good to woman, is that she, like the labor-classes, is in an oppressed condition; that her position, like theirs, is one of merciless degradation. Women are the creatures of an organized tyranny of men, as the workers are the creatures of an organized tyranny of idlers. Even where this much is grasped, we must never be weary of insisting on the non-understanding that for women, as for the laboring classes, no solution of the difficulties and problems that present themselves is really possible in the present condition of society. All that is done, heralded with no matter what flourish of trumpets, is palliative, not remedial. Both the oppressed classes, women and the immediate producers, must understand that their emancipation will come from themselves. Women will find allies in the better sort of men, as the laborers are finding allies among the philosophers, artists, and poets. But the one has nothing to hope from man as a whole, and the other has nothing to hope from the middle class as a whole.”

PP

“[Once socialism has been achieved] Clearly there will be equality for all, without distinction of sex. Thus, woman will be independent: her education and all other opportunities as those of man. Like him, she, if sound in mind and body (and how the number of women thus will grow!) will have to give her one, two, or three hours of social labor to supply the wants of the community, and therefore of herself. Thereafter she will be free for art or science, or teaching or writing, or amusement in any form.”

S

“Man has his own inclinations and a natural will which, in his actions, by means of his free choice, he follows and directs. There can be nothing more dreadful than that the actions of one man should be subject to the will of another; hence no abhorrence can be more natural than that which a man has for slavery. And it is for this reason that a child cries and becomes embittered when he must do what others wish, when no one has taken the trouble to make it agreeable to him. He wants to be a man soon, so that he can do as he himself likes.”

U

“A woman is embarrassed little that she does not possess certain high insights; that she is timid, and not fit for serious employment She is beautiful and captivates, and that is enough. Man should become more perfect as a man, and the woman as a wife.”

B

“It has not been understood even by those men and women above the average who have made the struggle for the greater freedom of women the very business of their lives. This fundamental fact is, that the question is one of economics. The position of women rests, as everything in our complex modern society rests, on an economic basis... The woman question is one of the organization of society as a whole.”

Z

“Woman wants control, man self-control.”

O

“My own sex, I hope, will excuse me, if I treat them like rational creatures, instead of flattering their fascinating graces, and viewing them as if they were in a state of perpetual childhood, unable to stand alone.”

N

“[I]f we revert to history, we shall find that the women who have distinguished themselves have neither been the most beautiful nor the most gentle of their sex.”

C

“Women are more inclined to be miserly than men. This is in keeping with the nature of woman, for the women have to be more sparing since they are spending money which they do not earn themselves.”

W

“The women’s question, however, is only present within those classes of society who are themselves the products of the capitalist mode of production. Thus it is that we find no women’s question in peasant circles that possess a natural (although severely curtailed and punctured) economy. But we certainly find a women’s question within those classes of society who are the very children of the modern mode of production. There is a women’s question for the women of the proletariat, the bourgeoisie, the intelligentsia and the Upper Ten Thousand. It assumes a different form according to the class situation of each one of these strata.”

G

“I love man as my fellow; but his scepter, real, or usurped, extends not to me, unless the reason of an individual demands my homage; and even then the submission is to reason, and not to man.”

AA

“Woman is born free and lives equal to man in her rights. Social distinctions can be based only on the common utility.”

LL

“Great progress was evident in the last Congress of the American Labor Union in that among other things, it treated working women with complete equality. While in this respect the English, and still more the gallant French, are burdened with a spirit of narrow-mindedness. Anybody who knows anything of history knows that great social changes are impossible without the feminine ferment. Social progress can be measured exactly by the social position of the fair sex (the ugly ones included).”

EE

“The less the skill and exertion of strength implied in manual labor, in other words, the more modern industry becomes developed, the more is the labor of men superseded by that of women. Differences of age and sex have no longer any distinctive social validity for the working class. All are instruments of labor, more or less expensive to use, according to their age and sex.”

SS

“[In the ideal household] all are equal and free – the women included. There is no place yet for slaves, nor, as a rule, for the subjugation of other tribes.”

D

“Thus, on the one hand, in proportion as wealth increased, it made the man’s position in the family more important than the woman’s, and on the other hand created an impulse to exploit this strengthened position in order to overthrow, in favor of his children, the traditional order of inheritance... Mother right, therefore, had to be overthrown, and overthrown it was.”

X

“In the old communistic household, which comprised many couples and their children, the task entrusted to women of managing the household was as much a public, a socially necessary industry as the procuring of food by the men. With the patriarchal family and still more with the single monogamous family, a change came. Household management lost its public character. It no longer concerned society. It became a private service; the wife became the head servant, excluded from all participation in social production... The modern individual family is founded on the open or concealed domestic slavery of the wife, and modern society is a mass composed of these individual families as its molecules.”

I

“Here there is no property, for the preservation and inheritance of which monogamy and male supremacy were established; hence there is no incentive to make this male supremacy effective. What is more, there are no means of making it so. Bourgeois law, which protects this supremacy, exists only for the possessing class and their dealings with the proletarians.... And now that large-scale industry has taken the wife out of the home onto the labor market and into the factory.... no basis for any kind of male supremacy is left in the proletarian household, except, perhaps, for something of the brutality toward women that has spread since the introduction of monogamy.”

T

“Socialism is the ideal state, but it can never be achieved while man is so selfish.”

2. When you have finished reading, discussing and sorting the quotations, call for your teacher to come to check your work. He or she may give you some hints and ask you to revise your thinking. He or she will return to recheck your work when you have revised your categories

Develop Topic Claims

Group Discussion Questions

3. Look at the quotations you have placed in the Enlightenment column. What conclusions or inferences about Enlightenment ideas and gender roles can you make from those quotations?
4. Look at the quotations you have placed in the Marxist column. What conclusions or inferences about Marxist ideas and gender roles can you make from those quotations?

Check your understanding

- Were you able to distinguish between Enlightenment and Marxist ideas about gender roles?
- Were you able to describe both Enlightenment and Marxist ideas about gender roles?

Task 2: Comparing Enlightenment and Marxist Ideas (Group)

Develop Claims of Similarities and Difference

Once your group has accurately sorted your quotations into Enlightenment and Marxist categories, your teacher will identify the speaker for each quotation.

1. Review the quotes, paying attention to the speaker for each one. What differences between the Enlightenment ideas and thinkers and the Marxist ideas and thinkers do you notice? What accounts for those differences? What questions does that raise about point-of-view?
2. Compare the ideas about gender roles of the male and female thinkers. How did the ideas of the male Enlightenment thinkers differ from the ideas of the male and female Marxist thinkers? How were they similar? How did the ideas of the female Enlightenment thinkers differ from the ideas of the male and female Marxist thinkers? How were they similar?

Now map the prompt below by following these directions: Figure out what the question is asking by circling EACH **topic** that you are required to discuss in the question. If the question asks you to discuss how one topic impacts or relates to another topic, draw an arrow linking the parts you must relate. Draw a box around the word that identifies the **relationship** between the themes that you must discuss. Use a solid line to underline what the question is requiring you to **do with that/those topics**, and use a dashed line to underline the **regions** and **time period**.

- Analysis the similarities and differences in the ways Enlightenment and Marxist ideas challenged or sustained 19th century gender roles.
3. What similarities exist between the ways Enlightenment and Marxist ideas challenged or sustained 19th-century gender roles?
 4. What differences exist between the ways Enlightenment and Marxist ideas challenged or sustained 19th-century gender roles?

Task 3: Apply your understanding

- Work alone to create three direct comparisons that reflect your understanding of the prompt below. You must include at least one similarity and one difference. To help you with this task, you can use the provided Direct Comparison Template. Check your notes for details, as you will need those to write strong direct comparisons. Be prepared to share your best work aloud with the class.
 - Analysis the similarities and differences in the ways Enlightenment and Marxist ideas challenged or sustained 19th century gender roles.

Direct Comparison Template

Though there are several ways to write a direct comparison, as you are practicing and learning to think comparatively, it is helpful to have a format to structure analysis.

Example: Cats and dogs are both mammals; both cats and dogs give birth to live young.

Example: Cats and dogs require differing diets: cats are strictly carnivores, while dogs are omnivores.

Below you will find a simple format to use as a template as you practice this skill.

A and B are similar in _____; both A and B _____.

A and B are different _____; A is _____ while B is _____.

Fill in the blanks with phrases and descriptions which accurately explain the similarity or difference.

- _____
- _____
- _____

- Use your claims of similarities and difference to write a thesis for this essay. Look back at your mapping of the prompt and use the template below to write your thesis.

Figure out what the question is asking by circling EACH topic that you are required to discuss in the question. If the question asks you to discuss how one topic impacts or relates to another topic, draw an arrow linking the parts you must relate. Draw a box around the word that identifies the **relationship** between the themes that you must discuss. Use a solid line to underline what the question is requiring you to **do with that/those topics**, and use a dashed line to underline the **regions** and **time period**.

Prompt: Analyze the similarities and differences in how trade in the Indian Ocean and the Sahara Desert impacted the culture of their respective societies in the period from 500 to 1450.

Thesis	
	The _____ (relationship) _____ of _____ (this) _____ on/and/to/in _____ (that) _____ in both _____ (first region) _____ and _____ (second region) _____ included _____ (1 st similarity claim) _____ and _____ (2 nd similarity claim) _____ during the period _____ (dates) _____.
	However, the _____ (relationship) _____ of _____ (this) _____ on/and/to/in _____ (that) _____ in _____ (first region) _____ and _____ (second region) _____ differ in that _____ (1 st difference claim) _____ and _____ (2 nd difference claim) _____.

3. In the comparison long essay you must always explain the reasons for the similarities and differences. Add a warrant statement to each of your claim/data direct comparisons that uses specific historical data from the quotes to explain the reason for the similarity or difference.

A and B are similar in (Claim); both A and B (Data). This is the case because (Warrant with Data from BOTH A and B).

A and B are different in (Claim); A is (Data) while B is (Data). This is the case because (Warrant with Data from BOTH A and B).

4. All long essay formats require synthesis. Read the rubric description of synthesis below. Work with a neighbor to write a few sentences that satisfy this requirement for the prompt.

<p>D. SYNTHESIS</p>	<p>TARGETED SKILL: Synthesis (C4, C5, or C6)</p>
<p>1 Point</p>	<p>1 Point</p> <p>Extends the argument by explaining the connections between the argument and ONE of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) A development in a different historical period, situation, era, or geographical area. b) A course theme and/or approach to history that is not the focus of the essay (such as political, economic, social, cultural, or intellectual history). c) A different discipline or field of inquiry (such as economics, government and politics, art history, or anthropology) (Note: For European and World History only). <hr/> <p>Scoring Note: <i>The synthesis point requires an explanation of the connections to different historical period, situation, era, or geographical area, and is not awarded for merely a phase or reference.</i></p>